Dear Jacob:

Attached is a referee report for “Testing for Rationality”.

This is a straightforward replication of my 2001 paper, “GARP for Kids.” There’s nothing novel, even the table format is identical! I’m flattered, and relieved the results replicate, but I can’t imagine why they think you would consider publishing it. I can’t think of an alternative outlet.

Sincerely,

[Signature]

Bill Harbaugh
Associate Professor

PS: To help in my efforts to be a good reviewer, I’d appreciate it if you could provide me with a copy of the other reviewer’s comments for this paper, and your decision.
Comments on “Testing for Rationality”

This is a straightforward replication of Harbaugh’s 2001 paper, “GARP for Kids.” Many possible extensions of that paper are possible – for example, different sorts of goods, additional goods, prices and incomes instead of discreet choices, different presentation methodologies, younger children. This paper could be much improved if the authors were to pursue this avenue. As it is the paper does not make a new contribution. I’d also advise them to read List and Millimet, “The Market: Catalyst for Rationality and Filter of Irrationality” as an example of new directions for this basic approach.